

Citizenship education in post-conflict contexts: A review of the literature

Education, Citizenship and
Social Justice
7(1) 33–57

© The Author(s) 2011
Reprints and permission: sagepub.
co.uk/journalsPermissions.nav
DOI: 10.1177/1746197911432593
esj.sagepub.com



Laura J. Quaynor

Emory University, USA

Abstract

In recent years, citizenship education has been the subject of much international attention, including two major cross-national studies. However, few reviews of civic education scholarship include research from post-conflict societies. This omission is notable because post-conflict situations offer distinct challenges to instilling both democratic norms and a sense of social cohesion to ensure democracy and social justice in the future. This paper seeks to address this need, providing a review of research on citizenship education in post-conflict contexts published in English-language journals in order to delineate similarities and differences across such contexts. Findings common to many studies on citizenship education in post-conflict countries include the avoidance of controversial issues, the unique role of ethnicity, a lack of trust in political parties and authoritarianism. Some studies also reported a movement towards global or regional identities and student desire for active citizenship education.

Keywords

citizenship education, civics, international, literature review, post-conflict

Introduction

In recent years, citizenship education has been the subject of much international attention, including two major cross-national studies (Hahn, 2010; Schultz et al., 2010; Torney-Purta et al., 2001). Both scholars and international policymakers in this field stress the importance of education that helps youth develop the tools to recognize and solve problems in their society (Banks, 2008; Ehman, 1980; Machel, 1996; Mirel, 2002; Olssen et al., 2004). However, few reviews of civic education scholarship include research from post-conflict societies. This omission is notable because post-conflict situations offer distinct challenges to instilling both democratic norms and a sense of social cohesion to ensure democracy and social justice in the future. This paper seeks to address this need, providing a review of research on citizenship education in post-conflict contexts published in English-language journals in order to delineate similarities and differences across such contexts.

Corresponding author:

Laura J. Quaynor, Division of Educational Studies, Emory University, 1784 N. Decatur Rd Suite 240, Atlanta, GA 30322, USA
Email: laura.quaynor@emory.edu

Citizenship education, though a crucial facet of reconstruction in post-conflict countries (Davies, 2004), is at once a specific subject and an overarching purpose of education (Dewey, 1916). All forms of education communicate messages to students about norms, values and ways they should act in their community and their nation. In countries that have experienced conflict, ideas about nationhood and violence are often embedded in the curriculum. For example, Davis (2002) writes about mathematics textbooks used in Afghanistan in which students completed mathematics problems regarding the speed of bullets as they fly towards Russian soldiers. Students completing these problems are learning about both mathematical calculations and that they belong to a national community that must be defended from outsiders.

A large number of countries now include citizenship education as a discrete part of the school curriculum (Schulz et al., 2010). In other nations, students learn about citizenship through courses including history, social studies, religious and moral education, and government (Hahn, 1998; Schulz et al., 2010). Across all contexts, citizenship education aims to develop ‘knowledge, skills, and attitudes that will enable [young people] to participate in the communities of which they are a part’ (Arthur et al., 2008: 5). However, the origin and nature of citizenship education varies across cultural contexts, as school systems develop curricula rooted in local historical concepts and responsive to particular societal challenges (Arthur et al., 2008; Steiner-Khamsi et al., 2002).

In recent years, intergovernmental organizations including the United Nations and World Bank have played a key role in shaping the citizenship education ‘policyscapes’, a term that denotes policy movements ‘transnational in character and which have at their core a particular constellation of visions, values and ideology’ (Carney, 2009: 79). The United Nations’ second Education for All (EFA) conference, held in 2000, encouraged governments to ‘stress democratic citizenship’ as one of the ‘over-arching values of education’ (UNESCO, 2008a: para. 24) UNESCO includes the spread of literacy as one of the goals of EFA, and has identified 2003–2012 as United Nations Literacy Decade (UNLD) with the slogan ‘Literacy as Freedom’. UNESCO policies relate literacy directly to democratic action, stating that ‘literacy is at the heart of basic education for all, and essential for eradicating poverty, reducing child mortality, curbing population growth, achieving gender equality and ensuring sustainable development, peace and democracy’ (UNESCO, 2008b: para. 2).

In addition, some development agencies that support EFA are expressly dedicated to the spread of democracy. For example, the United States Agency for International Development’s (USAID) central role is to ‘further America’s foreign policy interests in expanding democracy and free markets’ (USAID, 2011: para. 1). DANIDA, Denmark’s development agency, aims to promote freedom, democracy and human rights (DANIDA, 2010). As these agencies and organizations are significant funders of reconstruction in post-conflict contexts, their ideologies help to shape the nature of citizenship education in those contexts. In the midst of an international movement for education, literacy and democratic citizenship, resulting initiatives and scholarship must attend to the dynamic and conflicting ways in which these principles play out for students in post-conflict societies.

Defining ‘post-conflict’

The term ‘post-conflict’ is a term commonly used in political science, economics and development literature to indicate a society that has recently experienced a violent conflict that affected the daily lives of many citizens (Chetail, 2009). International organizations rely on political scientists to analyze conflicts and categorize states as ‘post conflict’ (UNDP, 2008). The International Peace Research Institute of Oslo and Uppsala University maintain an Armed Conflict Database widely used by both the World Bank and the United Nations to classify post-conflict countries. Political scientists working with this database categorize conflicts resulting in more than 25 deaths per year as conflicts or major conflicts (Harbom et al., 2009).

'Post-conflict' countries differ from countries actively experiencing violent conflict, as the task of reconstruction can be more seriously undertaken once the threat of immediate violence has past. However, the term is somewhat inadequate in describing the nature of conflict, which occurs on a continuum: societies can experience international conflicts, civil wars and state-sponsored violence. Sambanis (2004) provides a detailed review of debates within the field of political science around the difficulties of defining conflict. Societies that have experienced large-scale violent conflict are often deeply divided and more prone to future conflicts.

The stage of conflict in a society affects the stability and quality of education, and is also related to the types of organizations that work with education in that society. Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) such as the International Network for Education in Emergencies (INEE) concentrate on providing resources for education after a natural disaster or armed conflict, rather than in a more stable post-conflict situation. In contrast, NGOs and International NGOs (INGOs) including the International Rescue Committee, the World Bank and the United Nations provide resources both in the immediate aftermath of conflict and throughout post-conflict reconstruction phases.

Methodology

My survey of the literature began with a search of ERIC, JSTOR and *Dissertation Abstracts* databases using combinations of the terms *citizenship education*, *post-conflict*, *civic education* and *history education*. Because many studies regarding post-conflict societies may not use the term 'post-conflict' in their title, I used international databases to identify nations widely recognized as post-conflict countries. I chose to concentrate on conflicts ending after the Second World War. I began this project using the Uppsala Conflict Data Program's (UCDP) armed conflict database, maintained by Department of Peace and Conflict Research, Uppsala University and the Centre for the Study of Civil War at the International Peace Research Institute, Oslo (PRIO). I then triangulated these countries with those recognized as post-conflict by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP, 2008) and Global Security (2010) to identify countries that had experienced conflict that officially ended between 1950–2005. These sources consolidated databases maintained by political scientists regarding civil wars and political violence (Doyle and Sambanis, 2006; Lacina and Gleditsch, 2004; Sambanis, 2003; UCDP, 2008).

After identifying a list of 'post-conflict' countries, I searched the above databases for studies from these countries, using combinations of the country name and the terms *citizenship*, *education*, *civic* and *history*. With the same terms I culled from the research databases, I also identified studies from relevant books and articles. I excluded pieces that were strictly theoretical and did not involve systematic interaction with curriculum or people. These searches yielded 33 studies covering 18 post-conflict countries across the globe, with many of the studies concentrating on South Africa (9) and countries in the Balkan region (8).

After summarizing the research methods and primary findings of each study, I reread the summaries and coded the findings, generating descriptive categories as suggested for the first stages of grounded theory (Glaser and Strauss, 1967). I compiled these codes and noted how many studies from each country and geographical region could be classified into each category. In the following section, I provide summaries of each of the studies by region. Owing to the greater number of studies available from Europe and Africa, I only highlight relevant aspects of studies from those regions. A full description of each study can be found in Appendix A. The major multi-country studies concentrating on citizenship education in post-conflict contexts (Plut et al., 2002; Popadic et al., 2002; Weinstein et al., 2007) are described last. Finally, I discuss similarities and differences across the contexts and note necessary areas for future research.

Summaries of studies

Covering a wide range of countries, the research described here also spans methodological traditions, including curricular analyses, quantitative surveys and ethnographic studies. Although the findings of a study relate directly to the study design (Maxwell, 2005), together this body of research presents a more nuanced understanding of citizenship education in post-conflict contexts. This section begins in a region preoccupied by questions of war and peace in the last half century, the Middle East, and proceeds eastward around the globe.

Middle East

Within the Middle East¹, only the constitutional republic of Lebanon qualified as a democratic 'post-conflict' country, as the other countries involved in conflict in the region have been classified as continuously actively involved in conflict (Global Security, 2010). Lebanon was officially at peace following the Lebanese Civil War from 1975–1990, although in 2006 Hezbollah entered Lebanon into a conflict with Israel that displaced over one-quarter of the population (US Department of State, 2010g). In the studies reported below, data collection took place during the 'post-conflict' period, prior to 2006.

Akar (2007) studied adolescents' conceptions of citizenship and classroom-based citizenship education ($N = 31$) in two year 11 classrooms at two different co-educational private schools in urban Lebanon. Students completed a qualitative and quantitative survey, and participated in a full-class discussion on the subject of citizenship. Students in the study reported placing a high value on democratic principles, and showed a strong national identity. Indeed, students stated the belief that in order to participate in their society, citizens need a strong sense of national identity, awareness of rights, a desire to participate in dialogue and the will to promote environmental and public health.

However, the Lebanese students in the two private schools reported that both classroom practices and the social context discouraged active participation in citizenship. Students said that in the classroom, the citizenship curriculum emphasized memorization of facts rather than more participatory formats. Students also reported being discouraged from political participation because of a feeling of cynicism about politics. They reported a mistrust in politicians and political parties and a perception that those in power simply imposed their will on those without. An earlier study of Lebanese teachers' conceptions of citizenship and reported teaching practices in civic education reinforces these findings (Akar, 2006). Through semi-structured interviews, four experienced civics teachers in private schools pointed to the difficulties of promoting democratic citizenship in a society that exhibited substantial corruption and authoritarian tendencies. However, like the students, teachers expressed a belief that rights and responsibilities were a central component of citizenship, and that dialogue was important for citizenship. Though useful, these two studies would have benefited from a description of the samples in greater detail, particularly with respect to the class status of the students or the schools, to understand where these students and teachers fit into the divisions that characterize post-conflict Lebanon.

S. Joseph (2005) used an ethnographic approach to understand the ways 100 Lebanese children (spanning ages 5–13) understood rights and citizenship in one rural village after the civil war. This scholar reported that children who lived in a neighborhood with their relatives accessed rights through relationships. That is, they created kinship relationships with persons with access to resources that they needed in order to attend school or obtain healthcare, two basic human rights. Children established these relationships across gender, class, religious and ethnic lines. S. Joseph (2005) highlighted the lack of connections between global discourses about citizenship and human rights as individual and inalienable and the way these children were socialized to become citizens through relationships. This

study would have been strengthened by an observation about what the children learned in schools – that is, were teachers able to connect both the global and relational discourses?

The three studies described above focus on both formal and non-formal citizenship education in Lebanon. The views from inside and outside the schoolhouse seemed to differ: although students inside the school emphasized the need for national consciousness and awareness of rights, children outside of the schoolhouse accessed rights through relationships rather than through the nation or international community. Teachers interviewed believed in the importance of citizenship education, but pointed to the contradiction between the ideal of democratic citizenship and the ways in which power actually functioned in Lebanon.

Asia

On the Asian continent, I searched for research pertaining to civic education in Azerbaijan, Cambodia, Indonesia, Burma, Laos, North Korea, Pakistan, Sri Lanka and Tajikistan, which all experienced conflict in the past half century. The only countries where I was able to obtain information about research on civic education were Indonesia and Laos. Indonesia, a republic spread over an island archipelago in southeast Asia, experienced conflict between communists and right-wing gangs in the 1960s and government-sponsored violence in East Timor in the late 1990s (US Department of State, 2010d). Laos is a communist state that was heavily affected by the second Indochina war (1954–1975) and saw many refugees leave during the more draconian communist years (1975–1999) (US Department of State, 2010f). In these countries, two researchers found that both curriculum and teachers avoided the discussion of controversial issues. Fox (2003) reviewed the ways materials in the Laotian Basic Education curriculum portrayed gender and ethnic minority issues. The textbooks and syllabi omitted any discussion of rights of minority language speakers or members of minority cultures. Moreover, despite widespread discrimination against women and girls in Laotian society, the textbook made no mention of the need to pay attention to gender equity. The civic education syllabus focused on national pride and obedience.

Mapiasse (2007) examined the relationship between classroom climate, student engagement and learning outcomes in North Sulawesi, Indonesia. Adapting survey scales from the 1999 IEA study and other relevant literature, Mapiasse measured the following domains: Democratic Climate of the Civic Education Classroom (DCCEC), Student Engagement in Civic Education Classrooms (SECEC), Civic Knowledge and Interpretation Skills (CKIS), Student Concepts of Democracy (SCD) and Student Concepts of Citizenship (SCC). After piloting the instrument with 200 students and removing invalid items, Mapiasse surveyed 930 ninth-grade students in randomly sampled civic education classrooms. Using confirmatory factor analysis and Rasch measurement model analysis, Mapiasse showed that the democratic climate of the classroom was the most powerful predictor of student engagement and civic knowledge, but not useful in predicting student conceptions of democracy. Student engagement was a powerful predictor of student conceptions of democracy. Student conceptions of democracy were useful in predicting students' conceptions of citizenship, suggesting that students must understand democracy in order to be engaged citizens. The one unusual finding in this study was that the discussion of controversial issues in the classroom had a negative relationship with democratic climate, contradicting findings from an earlier large-scale cross-national study by Torney-Purta et al. (2001). Mapiasse (2007: 404) suggests that this negative relationship may be due to teachers raising controversial issues but acting as 'the ultimate resources of final opinions in front of their students'.

Laos and Indonesia have different types of government, undoubtedly resulting in widely different content in the civic education classroom. However, it is interesting that researchers in both countries

highlighted the ways controversial issues were treated. Although the civic education curriculum in Laos avoided controversial issues altogether, the discussion of controversial issues in civic education classrooms in Indonesia coincided with a reduction in the democratic climate of the classroom.

Latin America

Within Latin America (both Central and South America), independent scholars reported findings from the post-conflict countries of Argentina and Peru. In addition, the post-conflict countries of Guatemala and Columbia participated in the International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS), yielding important data. These four countries all experienced state-sponsored violence. In Argentina, different military regimes held control of the country from 1955–1983, engaging from 1976–1983 in a ‘dirty war’ against dissenters or activists that resulted in the killing or disappearance of 30,000 civilians (Global Security, 2005). In contrast, the government of Peru fought with the Shining Path from 1980–2000, which resulted in 69,000 deaths, mostly of residents of rural villages (Freedom House, 2010). The conflict in Guatemala was significantly more violent and ethnicized. Between 1966 and 1982, Guatemala experienced a series of military governments who sparred at times with guerilla forces. During the most violent period, an estimated 200,000 unarmed indigenous civilians were killed (US Department of State, 2010c).

Researchers in these countries studied students, teachers and textbooks to understand the nature of citizenship education. Colombia has also experienced multiple waves of conflict between the government and guerilla fighters, from ‘La Violencia’ in the 1950s through the remobilization of the Revolutionary Armed Forces of Columbia (FARC) in the 1990s (US Department of State, 2010a). Overall, findings from seven studies suggested that schools promoted a type of citizenship associated with Spanish-language and middle-class values, and were not responsive to poor and indigenous communities. In addition, the level of civic knowledge was alarmingly low among communities of a low socio-economic level. However, researchers also documented the influence of international civic norms on civic education.

In Argentina, G. Joseph (1999) performed 13 months of fieldwork in Buenos Aires to explore national identity among the professional middle class, those affiliated with the *Colegio Nacional de Buenos Aires* (CNBA), a prestigious public high school. Individuals identified ‘being civilized’ as an important aspect of their identity promoted by this school. G. Joseph argues that this narrative is a racialized way of identifying Argentina with Europe and national Argentinean identity with a transnational White community.

In a study that also highlighted a unified national identity and the suppression of difference, Astiz and Mendez (2006) conducted a textual analysis of the basic curriculum and textbooks produced by the best-selling presses in Argentina. Examining statements and graphics related to ‘the educated person’ using Fairclough’s (2001) model of critical discourse analysis, the researchers found significant differences between the federal education law and both the common national curriculum (CBC) and the information contained in textbooks. Although the federal education law emphasized citizenship education, the CBC mentioned citizenship as a topic only once in its table of contents. In addition, the discussion of discrimination in the textbooks was limited and superficial; it acknowledged racial discrimination in historical terms only, as something that was previously a problem and is now solved. The researchers also found that curriculum and textbooks omitted information about discrimination based on gender or disability status. Astiz and Mendez (2006) contend that these discrepancies between the national education law and curriculum reflect the difference between a global idea about citizenship, promoted by policy makers influenced by international organizations, and local understandings about Argentinean identity.

Despite the shortcomings of some Argentinean textbooks, Suarez (2008) noted the ways in which they have changed over time. In a study of Argentinean and Costa Rican textbooks, Suarez (2008) attempted to characterize the intended content of civic education. Analyzing nine Argentinean textbooks from 1983–1994 and seven from 1994–2008, Suarez focused on counting the frequency of relevant keywords, such as ‘rights’ and ‘nation’. Textbooks from the latter period mentioned global aspects of citizenship, such as ‘human rights’ and ‘equality’ more frequently than in the earlier period. Discussion of more national aspects of citizenship, such as the ‘nation’, ‘patriotism’ and ‘the constitution’, declined by half in textbooks between the two different periods.

Although the textbooks analyzed by Suarez may have increased their focus on global citizenship in recent years, teachers in Argentina act as ‘gatekeepers’ (Thornton, 2005) between the intended curriculum presented in the textbooks and the curriculum as experienced by students. Oraison and Perez (2009) pursued a two-year action research project in one Argentinean high school. The project aimed to promote students’ critical active citizenship by fostering democratic relationships among teachers, students and community members. The researchers’ initial assessment found that teachers had expectations that parents help students with homework, yet believed that parents were illiterate (which would impede them from giving students such help). The researchers then initiated workshops with students ($n = 20$), teachers ($n = 12$) and parents ($n = 40$) in order to create a plan for community improvement. Over six workshops, all participants agreed to concentrate on providing breakfast for students, a service previously provided by the school but discontinued due to a lack of resources. Although this initial project was successful, the association among stakeholders became unsuccessful owing to a lack of teacher participation. Teachers identified the project as both extra unpaid work and as not a proper use of their time, as it was not focused on academic work. This sentiment and lack of teacher engagement led to the discontinuation of the project.

In Peru, a national evaluation of citizenship education further underlined the differences between the curriculum as intended and as experienced by students. This study was distinctive both in its size and the cross-curricular nature of the analysis, found low levels of civic knowledge and skills (Frisancho and Reategui, 2009). Researchers surveyed a nationally representative sample of 6th grade ($n = 13,708$) and 11th grade ($n = 14,305$) students. Only 0.6% of students demonstrated the level of knowledge about citizenship expected for their grade level. Moreover, 39.5% of urban students and 61.1% of rural students demonstrated no citizenship knowledge, suggesting a failure to implement the citizenship curriculum and large discrepancies between the quality of education in rural and urban areas. These students were not able to distinguish between a democracy and a dictatorship, identify their own rights and responsibilities, identify corrupt behavior or explain the connections between the role of media and democracy. The authors did not provide information about the instrument used to assess students, or demographic information about the sample, making it difficult to fully understand the meaning of these results. Students who responded incorrectly to questions on the assessment may have not had functional levels of literacy in Spanish or otherwise have been unable to understand the instrument.

Both Colombia and Guatemala participated in the 2009 International Civics and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS), a cross-national study that surveyed random samples of students in their eighth year of schooling (Schulz et al., 2010; Schulz et al., 2011; Schulz and Gonzalez, 2011). Across six countries in Latin America, 30,000 students from 1000 schools participated in the study. In all countries, the citizenship curriculum included violent conflict, democracy, globalization, sustainable development, tolerance and plurality. Importantly, more than half of students in both Colombia and Guatemala had civic knowledge achievement scores at or below Proficiency Level 1, indicating that like students in Peru, they did not have the civic knowledge necessary to participate in their

democracy. Students who demonstrated higher civic knowledge expressed less acceptance of authoritarianism and corruption than those with lower civic knowledge. Interestingly, majorities of students were able to identify reasons that vigilante justice should be prohibited, but were unable to identify the consequences of dictatorships or characteristics of authoritarian governments. A majority of students in Guatemala and Colombia indicated trust in the armed forces, schools and the media, but not political parties or courts. In Guatemala, only 33% of students indicated trust in the police.

These studies from countries across Latin America provide a diverse array of findings about the role of citizenship education in the curriculum, teachers' perceptions of the meanings of citizenship education, and the rural and urban divide in education. Some textbooks and education policy emphasized global citizenship and human rights, and others avoided controversial subjects such as discrimination altogether. Students at an elite private school felt that their school taught them how to be citizens of a Europeanized, 'civilized' world and teachers in an impoverished school failed to see participating with students and parents to solve community problems as part of their job. Furthermore, evidence suggested that citizenship education across Peru, Colombia and Guatemala was left nearly unimplemented, with a large number of students demonstrating little to no civic knowledge.

Europe

Within Europe, Northern Ireland, Cyprus and the countries in the Balkan region are often studied as examples of post-conflict, divided societies. These conflicts range in intensity from the lower-scale violent conflict between Greek and Turkish Cypriots in the 1960s-1970s to the decades of politically motivated bombings in Northern Ireland ending in 1998 and the conflict involving civilian massacres in the Balkan region during the 1990s (BBC, 2005; US Department of State, 2010b). Policy shifts in the post-conflict period included the introduction of new models of citizenship into the policy discourse (Spajic-Vrkas, 2003) and the curriculum of schools (Gallagher, 2005). During the past decade, researchers working in these countries have considered diverse issues including student conceptions of citizenship, the views of pre-service teachers, and the role of textbooks. Because of the large number of studies in Europe, below I summarize the studies pertaining to each country or region and note any conflicting findings.

In two different studies, pre-service teachers pointed to the use of global (Koutselini, 2008) or European (Mason, 2005) citizenship as a promising concept for promoting reconciliation in their society. Many of the 50 pre-service teachers interviewed by Koutselini were critical of the role of international organizations in solving their national problems, yet hopeful that the idea of belonging to a global community would help resolve the tension of national and ethnic identity in Cyprus. In Mason's (2005) study, Albanian pre-service teachers living in Macedonia ($N = 31$) reported the need for schools to encourage intercultural understanding by giving students exposure to people from different linguistic and cultural backgrounds, and focusing on common European citizenship. They also saw learning English as a linguistic neutral ground upon which people from different ethnicities could meet.

Although global or regional citizenship held promise for pre-service teachers, citizenship education in studies of European post-conflict countries seemed to be fraught with avoidance, either of the other ethnic group or of controversial issues. Kouselini and Papanastasiou (1997), through their analysis of primary textbooks in Cyprus, concluded that textbooks concentrated on the concept of cooperation between Greek and Turkish Cypriots rather than helping students to negotiate controversial issues. In an ethnographic study, Hromadzic (2008) stressed the divided nature of the 'integrated' Mostar Gymnasium in Bosnia-Herzegovina, where students were in the same building but rarely interacted, as they followed two different curricula. Teachers in integrated schools in

Northern Ireland ($N = 18$) expressed the choices they made to avoid controversial topics, compromising the premise of the schools to encourage learning across differences (Donnelly, 2004). Even when students were engaged in interfaith dialogues in Northern Ireland, King (2005) reported their tendency to avoid discussing controversial issues or seriously consider differing perspectives.

Despite the fact that students and teachers avoided controversial issues in practice, both students and educational stakeholders in Northern Ireland emphasized the need to include controversial issues in the curriculum. Community leaders interviewed by Niens and McIlrath (2010) expressed the belief that teachers needed to help students think critically about controversial issues in order to avoid the indoctrination of students within schools. Students from the ages of 14–24 showed overall interest in political issues and a desire to deal with controversial issues. They also identified a need to acquire political literacy in schools in order to be able to engage politically (Lomas, 1999).

As described above, studies on citizenship education in the European region concentrated on the difficulties of engaging in meaningful education with students coming from previously fighting groups. In Northern Ireland and Cyprus, teachers and textbooks emphasized cooperation between groups and avoided the discussion of how students might resolve conflicts of interest. In Bosnia-Herzegovina, students and teachers from different groups lived separate lives, even at a school intended to foster integration between Bosnians and Croats. In Macedonia, pre-service teachers pointed to the ability to emphasize English and a European identity to promote commonalities and avoid discussions of difference.

Africa

Any findings about education in post-conflict countries may be especially salient for countries in Africa, which have seen more violent conflicts and a higher mortality rate in each violent conflict than any other region (Gettleman, 2010). Although many countries in sub-Saharan Africa could be considered post-conflict, research on citizenship education concentrated on only three: Mozambique, Rwanda and South Africa. These countries differ widely in the scale and type of conflict. In Mozambique, an armed anti-colonial liberation struggle by the Front for the Liberation of Mozambique (FRELIMO) was followed by a 15-year civil war resulting in one million deaths and nearly two million refugees (US Department of State, 2010h). Rwanda experienced its most notable conflict after a two-year armed clash between the Tutsi-backed Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF) and the government led to the genocide of 800,000 Tutsis and moderate Hutus (Gourevitch, 1998). In South Africa, following the systematic repression of blacks by a white minority, violent struggles occurred between the state and groups working for blacks' rights (US Department of State, 2010i). Due to the number of studies conducted in Africa, I will highlight the most salient research themes and provide an example study for each theme.

A number of studies reported an authoritarian culture of schools that prevented democratic or inquiry-based methods in civic education (Freedman et al., 2008; Harber and Serf, 2006; Porteus et al., 2002). In Rwanda, Freedman et al. (2008) describe how the development of curriculum for history education in Rwanda also demonstrated a tendency to minimize students' exposure to societal conflicts. In this context, both teachers and the national government ultimately chose to teach history primarily to promote a unified national identity rather than teaching students how to use historical evidence to explore historical questions (Freedman et al., 2008). In focus groups, the researchers found that recognizing multiple perspectives was not a priority for teachers. Rather, 'the teachers expressed a strong need for "truth" about any narratives that entered the classroom' (Freedman et al., 2008: 678).

A variety of studies portrayed similar authoritarian tendencies in South African schools. One study by Porteus et al. (2002) describes a 2000 effort sponsored by the Department of Education, researchers from the Witwatersrand University Education Policy Unit, and other organizations. They undertook a school-based research project to determine how teachers, pupils and parents understood the relationships between values, democracy and education. Through questionnaires and participatory workshops, educators reported holding negative beliefs about parents and students, stating that students were undisciplined and parents did not value education. Educators themselves valued obedience and discipline, desiring that both students and parents respect the schools' standards of behavior (Porteus et al., 2002). Most students and parents asserted that the school was a place where they felt disrespected by educators' language, use of corporal punishment and sexual abuse towards girls. Based on this report, the Department of Education formed goals for schools in South Africa, which included the need to develop critical thinking skills, caring schools and the values of equity, tolerance, multilingualism, openness, accountability and 'honor' (meaning national loyalty). These goals influenced the formation of a new plan for citizenship education, which included reforming the history curriculum to encourage anti-racism, integrating arts and African languages into schools, and emphasizing discussion-based classes on civic education.

Repeatedly, in studies conducted in South Africa, teachers reported promoting democratic values but not active citizenship in the classroom. Waghid (2009) examined the type of civic education taught in Islamic schools known as madrassahs in Western Cape Province. Interviewing 20 educators who worked with students ages 8–16, the researchers found that these educators promoted only a 'thin' conception of citizenship. Educators reported that they did not emphasize critical thinking or active participation 'due to time constraints and large classes' (Waghid, 2009: 119). However, educators highlighted respect for life, both human and non-human, which connects to conceptions of human rights and environmental stewardship.

In other studies, teachers stated that they wanted students to acquire democratic values, though they valued authoritarianism in the classroom (Kubow, 2007; Scheoman, 2005). In a study of teacher conceptions of democracy in South Africa and Kenya, Kubow (2007: 316) held focus groups with 27 teachers, asking the questions: '(1) What is democracy? and (2) What characteristics/traits do South African or Kenyan citizens need to function in a democratic society?' Kubow reported that these teachers discussed democracy as involving values, equality and freedom; specifically, values included tolerance and hard work, equality focused on gender equality, and freedom involved both freedom of speech and of participation. South African teachers in Kubow's study also highlighted the need for citizens to have the value of *ubuntu* (respect) shown through caring for and respecting others.

Teachers may concentrate on authoritarianism within the school because of a lack of exposure to more democratic teaching methods. Harber and Serf (2006) conducted open-ended interviews with 18 teacher education students in South Africa in order to understand what pre-service teachers learned about teaching citizenship education. Students recounted learning how to hold classroom discussions, but not learning how to deal with controversial issues. Further, students noted that most of their teacher education courses were conducted through lectures rather than active methods. Their curriculum covered information about HIV/AIDS, but not gender-based issues or homosexuality and homophobia, both currently salient issues in South Africa, where heads of state have both denied that HIV causes AIDS and been tried for rape (Gumede, 2008). The authors thus point out the gaps between policy documents that promote democratic education for students and these experiences of pre-service teachers.

Students in other studies affirmed that, although they integrated democratic practices into their life experiences, they did not practice democracy at school. Tlhapi (2007) investigated secondary students' reported citizenship behaviors in their family, peer groups, school and wider community.

In focus group interviews, the researcher asked students about their lives in order to determine how South Africa's transition to democracy affected their interpersonal relationships. Most students reported democratic participation in their families, with their peers and on a national level. However, within their schools and communities, students stated that they did not participate in a democratic fashion, and that these spaces seemed more autocratic than their peer or family interactions. Most students expressed a desire to be more active in their communities and in their schools. Interaction with students from different cultural backgrounds was the main way students reported learning about democratic citizenship within the school.

One project sponsored by USAID documented that in order to increase student acquisition of democratic values and skills, participatory methods were necessary. Finkel and Ernst (2005) surveyed 600 high school students in South Africa in eight different provinces, of which 385 had participated in civic education programs, and 215 had not, but were enrolled in equivalent types of schools. The researchers reported that civic education increased basic political knowledge among students, but had 'weaker effects on democratic values, skills, and participatory orientations' (Finkel and Ernst, 2005: 352). They stressed that the students who were more successful in developing these democratic values and skills had the opportunity to engage in participatory methods in their classroom, including role-playing, simulations and group projects, with teachers that they respected.

The above studies from Africa report classrooms marked by a desire for authority. In Rwanda, teachers felt the need to have a singular historical narrative, suggesting that allowing students to investigate historical evidence may be dangerous. In South Africa, teachers reported valuing democracy, just not in the classroom. Students agreed that their interactions with family, peer groups and national politics were more democratic than those within schools. However, students who attended classes using participatory methods demonstrated higher levels of democratic values and skills than those who did not.

Multi-country studies

Three large multi-country studies offer rich data for understanding similarities in citizenship education across post-conflict contexts. In the first study, Weinstein et al. (2007) investigated secondary schools in Croatia, Kosovo, Bosnia and Herzegovina and Rwanda, holding interviews and focus groups with representative samples of students, teachers, parents, administrators, educational specialists and policymakers. Three common themes were identified. First, participants' attitudes towards teaching and schools were steeped in a fear of violence reappearing. For example, teachers and parents expressed the need to manage classroom talk in order to avoid controversial issues. There was an avoidance of interethnic contact based on this fear. In Rwanda, participants stressed the desire to avoid talking about ethnicity overall. The fear of future violence led to considerable mistrust of other persons and institutions. Second, participants voiced differing opinions about the distribution of power among different ethnic groups. Groups in power seemed to desire preserving the control they enjoyed, whereas groups who had lost power desired maintaining some type of power, from the need to preserve a group identity to the need to regain political power. Third, these tensions over power and fear of violence affected the participants' views of the curriculum. Depending on the side of the conflict that their group was on, some wanted to teach about the conflict and some wanted to omit it from the curriculum. In Rwanda, the government did not permit teachers to present the genocide as an ethnic conflict – rather, teachers were to highlight how the conflict was a result of colonialism.

In a second multinational study, Plut et al. (2002) reported a content analysis of the presentation of democracy in history and mother tongue language textbooks for the last grade of compulsory

education in South Africa, Mozambique, Bosnia and Herzegovina, and then Yugoslavia (circa 1999; present-day Serbia). In Bosnia-Herzegovina and Yugoslavia (Serbia), textbooks stressed loyalty to one's own ethnic group over peace education, and included the subject of basic civil defense in the eighth grade curriculum. Rights were presented in a negative form, giving students examples of persons who had been deprived of their rights. National independence was presented as a positive value and described as the right to resist aggressors. For example, the Serbian fifth grade reader stated that it is 'better to die once than to serve a foreigner forever' (Plut et al., 2002: 123). With important consequences for civic education, textbooks included little procedural information about democracy.

In contrast to the textbooks described above, textbooks from South Africa emphasized critical thinking and participatory skills, in both history and language textbooks. Stressing communal rights, history textbooks provided information on the equality of nations and states, socio-economic rights, and the distribution and control of power, though neglecting to describe basic human rights. In Mozambique, students continued to use textbooks from 1975–1992, as at the time of the study no new textbooks had been created. Similar to the South African textbooks, Mozambican textbooks focused on national identity and the struggle for national independence. Instead of a focus on individual human rights, the textbooks discussed the rights of African countries to determine their own destinies.

Popadic et al. (2002) used a survey instrument to investigate how teachers and students understood the concepts of human rights and democracy in the same four countries studied by Plut et al. (2002). Teachers' responses differed substantially among three of the countries (no data were collected from Mozambican teachers). In Bosnia and Herzegovina, teachers ($N = 155$) expressed distrust in their present political system, and low awareness of techniques for conflict resolution. They affirmed the need for authoritarianism in schools and most expressed skepticism that students could learn democracy in schools. In Yugoslavia (present-day Serbia) teachers' responses were ambivalent on each measure in the study. They agreed with political democracy, but did not believe that teachers should educate students about politics. South African teachers also valued democracy, but expressed views that democracy was a political concept which did not extend to the composition of the school. Interestingly, there was a negative relationship between work conditions and views on democracy. If teachers reported better work conditions they were more likely to express authoritarian tendencies. A better knowledge of rights was also correlated with more positive democratic attitudes.

Students in both Bosnia-Herzegovina and Serbia exhibited distrust in politicians and a high belief in authoritarianism. Bosnian students reported that democracy, which should be characterized by peace, was clearly not the system in place in Bosnia-Herzegovina. Students from both countries had low levels of civic knowledge, and stated that they learned more about democracy from the television than from their teachers.

In contrast, students in Mozambique and South Africa had moderate or high levels of civic knowledge. Mozambican students also expressed high degrees of belief in authoritarianism and suspicion of democracy, with over half of the students saying that democracy results in fights and conflicts. Demonstrating a more active and positive conception of democracy, South African students reported seeing participation in organizations in civil society as important, and valued human rights and democracy. Above all, these students expressed a need for economic rights, specifically a decent standard of living. Importantly, students with a higher knowledge of laws had less authoritarian views, and those with a higher knowledge of rights were more supportive of practicing democracy throughout their society.

Throughout these multi-country studies, student and teacher distrust in political parties and systems was evident. In addition, curriculum emphasized ethnic nationalism rather than democratic participation. Notably, students in South Africa, which experienced a conflict that was ultimately

resolved through peaceful sharing of power, exhibited the most positive views about democracy and participatory citizenship.

Common threads

Despite the wide range of countries and findings discussed in the studies above, an analysis of each study's findings yields interesting trends. Based on the reported studies, it appears that discussion of controversial issues rarely occurs in civic education classrooms in post-conflict countries. Students and teachers in many societies reported a desire to avoid contact with persons from previously antagonistic groups, and many lacked trust in political parties. Finally, teachers and students in many of these countries showed authoritarian tendencies and a skepticism about democracy. Studies conducted in Northern Ireland, Lebanon and South Africa reported students with more democratic leanings than studies in other countries.

These common threads revolve around the functioning of power in a post-conflict society. The types of power, including corruption, exercised by political parties engenders distrust from teachers and students alike. Power relations and customs in the classroom directly affect the implementation of citizenship education. The open discussion of controversial issues requires both a willingness by the teacher to give up intellectual control of the classroom, and a willingness by students to engage in the dangerous enterprise of talking across differences. Curricula written by an intergovernmental organization or local agency that focuses on active citizenship education may not be implemented in a classroom that holds authoritarianism as a value. Below, I discuss the ways each study demonstrated these common threads.

Avoidance of controversial issues

Each study that focused on the exploration of controversial issues in the classroom mentioned the ways students, teachers, policymakers and textbooks avoided topics including the recent conflict, inequality and discrimination based on gender, race or disability status. Even in studies that reported the mention of controversial issues in a classroom setting, in-depth discussion was absent. In Mapiasse's (2007) study in North Sulawesi, Indonesia, students who reported that controversial issues were brought up in their classrooms also reported a less democratic classroom climate that students who did not report talking about controversial issues in class, suggesting that when controversial issues were mentioned, the teacher may have positioned him or herself as the authority with the 'answer' to the issue. Even in a mixed classroom setting in Northern Ireland, where students intended to discuss controversial issues, King (2005) reported that students tended to minimize points of conflict through their conversational patterns, choosing not to disclose personal information or bring up topics that would draw attention to their religion.

Ethnicity highlighted or avoided

In studies conducted in Bosnia-Herzegovina (Hromadzic, 2008), Croatia, Kosovo (Weinstein et al., 2007) and Yugoslavia (Serbia) (Plut et al., 2002), teachers, students and textbooks stressed the need to be loyal to one's own ethnic group and avoid others perhaps out of fear. In contrast, participants in Rwanda avoided the mention of ethnicity altogether and were in fact prohibited from considering the genocide as an inter-ethnic conflict (Freedman et al., 2008; Weinstein et al., 2007). Similarly, textbooks in Mozambique and South Africa, both multi-ethnic states, encouraged nationalism and the country's independence and right to self-determination over individual rights or ethnic identities (Plut et al., 2002).

Lack of trust in political parties

The existence of a competitive, multiparty political system is one of the most important hallmarks of a democracy (Freedom House, 2005). However, in post-conflict countries specifically in Europe and the Middle east, respondents reported a cynicism about politicians and political parties. Students in Lebanon, Yugoslavia (Serbia), as well as teachers in Bosnia-Herzegovina and Cyprus expressed high levels of distrust of political parties (Akar, 2007; Koutselini, 2008; Popadic et al., 2002). These respondents held that political parties were concerned with maintaining power rather than serving their constituency. Weinstein et al. (2007) also found that struggles over power between the former ruling group and the current ruling group was a dominant concern in Croatia, Kosovo and Rwanda.

Authoritarianism, especially among groups in power

In a surprising number of studies, both teachers and students scored high on measures of valuing authoritarianism. Both teachers and students in countries in the Balkan region exhibited authoritarian tendencies, and in Mozambique, students were highly critical of democracy, associating democracy with violence. Multiple studies in South Africa and Argentina found that teachers valued human rights and democracy in general, but stated that the school should be an authoritarian space (Oraison and Perez, 2009; Popadic et al., 2002; Porteus et al., 2002; Waghid, 2009). Interestingly, South African teachers in schools with fewer resources were more positive about democracy than those with more resources (Popadic et al., 2002). This relationship between lack of power and an increased value placed on democracy was seen among students as well. In Soule's (2000) reporting of the Civitas program's impact on student knowledge, skills and values in Bosnia-Herzegovina, she found that students belonging to the majority ethnic group (Bosniacs) and students in college preparatory schools had more authoritarian tendencies than students in the minority ethnic group (Bosnian Croats) and students in vocational schools.

Some movement towards global/regional identities

In three notable examples, textbooks and teachers increased an emphasis on global or regional citizenship following a conflict (Koutselini, 2008; Mason, 2005; Suarez, 2008). In Argentina, global aspects of citizenship in textbooks doubled, while the mention of national aspects of citizenship sharply decreased, in the years after the military rule during which thousands of citizens disappeared (Suarez, 2008). In Macedonia, pre-service teachers pointed to the use of the English language and a common European identity as a way to increase interethnic contact and understanding (Mason, 2005). Pre-service teachers in Cyprus also pointed to global citizenship as a useful concept in promoting reconciliation between the Greek Cypriots and Turkish Cypriots (Koutselini, 2008).

Active citizenship education

Although students in some post-conflict societies seemed to desire avoiding controversial issues and politics, studies from Northern Ireland and Lebanon cited students who desired increased political literacy and wanted a more active citizenship education curriculum than they experienced (Akar, 2007; Lomas, 1999; Watling and Arlow, 2002). In studies from Bosnia-Herzegovina, Indonesia and South Africa, a democratic classroom climate and the use of participatory methods increased students' civic engagement, participatory skills and knowledge about democracy (Finkel and Ernst, 2005; Mapiasse, 2007; Soule, 2000). In post-conflict countries, as in other countries,

teachers' ability to use participatory methods to teach civic education may be impaired by a lack of training. Harber and Serf's (2006) findings from interviews with South African pre-service teachers suggested that these teachers experienced mostly lectures during their teacher preparation, and were not sufficiently prepared to lead students in a discussion of civic issues.

It is notable that although active citizenship education is powerful in increasing students' civic engagement, skills and knowledge, it is difficult to implement. Changing the nature and culture of citizenship education requires structural change in the ways schools function and that teachers are trained and supported in the classroom. In addition, appropriate ways for students to engage in citizenship education may differ across contexts. Teacher training and support should reflect these nuances.

Omissions

Studies reported here describe a rich variety of both quantitative and qualitative methods used to investigate citizenship education in post-conflict contexts across the globe. However, significant gaps are evident within the literature. Notably, I did not find any research on citizenship education in post-conflict countries in West Africa, a region that has experienced substantial conflict in the past decades. In addition, few studies in post-conflict contexts reported data from classroom observations regarding how students and teachers actually talk about citizenship within the classroom. Understanding the ways students and teachers discuss both citizenship and controversial issues within post-conflict contexts will help researchers and teachers to identify the dynamics of these conversations and suggest ways to deepen dialogue across difference while also respecting the sensitive nature of the post-conflict context. Such studies must consider classroom interactions within the wider context of the ways power functions in a particular post-conflict society.

Conclusion

Education for citizenship and the very concept of citizenship are often contested issues in societies that have experienced violent conflict (Enslin, 2003). Scholars and international organizations emphasize that schools in such contexts should encourage 'social cohesion through quality and equity' (Machel, 2007: 29). As noted by Weinstein et al. (2007) studies pursued in post-conflict contexts must take into consideration the location of research participants within regional, class and ethnic groups, especially salient in perceptions of citizenship education. This review of the literature shows that in such societies, the promotion of social cohesion among such groups is a difficult and enormous task. Students and teachers may have lost trust in political parties, be afraid to engage in controversial issues, avoid interethnic contact, and be more comfortable with authoritarianism than democracy. These findings all point to the complex nature of shifting power relations in post-conflict contexts. Moreover, in societies with limited resources, the development of new materials for citizenship education may not be an educational priority compared to compensating teachers and reconstructing school buildings.

In response to these challenges, multiple studies suggest that an emphasis on global and regional identities within citizenship education, as well as the use of participatory methods, may encourage tolerance and active citizenship. Fear and mistrust in citizenship education was not pervasive: many students, teachers and community members in regions as diverse as Northern Ireland, South Africa and Lebanon also reported a desire for active political participation and dialogue in the classroom. Although teachers do have the potential to be critical pedagogues and social activists (Kirk, 2004; Ndura, 2006), they must themselves have honed the tools necessary to promote the

transformation they desire in their country. To borrow from Malcolm X's words most often applied to multicultural education, teachers 'can't teach what they don't know'. If stakeholders in post-conflict societies wish to promote democratic civic engagement, schools must be supported with teacher education programs and curricular materials that include democratic participation and the development of critical thinking.

Footnote

1. Note that the Middle East is also referred to as Southwest Asia.

References

- Akar B (2006) Teachers' reflections on the challenges of teaching citizenship education in Lebanon: a qualitative pilot study. *Reflecting Education* 2(2). Available at: <http://www.reflectingeducation.net/index.php/reflecting/article/view/35/35>.
- Akar B (2007) Citizenship education in Lebanon: an introduction into students' concepts and learning experiences. *Educate* 7(2): 2–18.
- Arthur J, Davies I and Hahn C (2008) Introduction. In: Arthur J, Davies I and Hahn C (eds) *The SAGE Handbook of Education for Citizenship and Democracy*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE, 1–10.
- Astiz M and Mendez G (2006) Education for citizenship: the Argentine case in comparison. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice* 1: 175–200.
- Banks JA (2008) Diversity, group identity, and citizenship education in a global age. *Educational Researcher* 37(2): 129–139.
- BBC (2005) Timeline: siege of Srebrenica. Available at: <http://news.bbc.co.uk>.
- Carney S (2009) Negotiating policy in an age of globalization: exploring educational 'policyscapes' in Denmark, Nepal, and China. *Comparative Education Review* 53(1): 63–88.
- Chetail, V (2009) *Post-Conflict Peacebuilding: A Lexicon*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- DANIDA (2010) Strategy for Denmark's development cooperation. Available at: <http://um.dk/en/danida-en/goals/strategy/>.
- Davies L (2004) *Conflict and Education: Complexity and Chaos*. London: Routledge.
- Davis C (2002) 'A' is for Allah, 'J' is for Jihad. *World Policy Journal* 19(1): 90–94.
- Dewey J (1916). *Democracy and Education*. MacMillan: New York, NY.
- Donnelly C (2004). What price harmony? teachers' methods of delivering an ethos of tolerance and respect for diversity in an integrated school in Northern Ireland. *Educational Research* 46(1): 3–16.
- Doyle MW and Sambanis N (2006) *Making War and Building Peace: United Nations Peace Operations*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Ehman L (1980). The American school in the political socialization process. 50(1): 99–119.
- Enslin P (2003) Citizenship education in post-apartheid South Africa. *Cambridge Journal of Education* 33(1): 73–83.
- Fairclough N (2001) Critical discourse analysis as a method in social scientific research. In: Wodak R and Meyer M (eds) *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. London: SAGE.
- Finkel, S and Ernst, HR (2005) Civic education and the development of political knowledge and democratic orientations in post-apartheid South Africa. *Political Psychology* 26(3): 333–364.
- Fox C (2003) No place for girls? Gender, ethnicity and citizenship education in the Lao People's Democratic Republic. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative Education* 33: 401–412.
- Freedman SW, Weinstein HM, Murphy K, et al. (2008) Teaching history after identity-based conflicts: the Rwanda experience. *Comparative Education Review* 53: 673–690.
- Freedom House (2005) Methodology. Available at: <http://www.freedomhouse.org>.
- Freedom House (2010) Peru. Available at: <http://www.freedomhouse.org>.
- Frisancho S and Reategui F (2009). Moral education and post-war societies: the Peruvian case. *Journal of Moral Education* 38: 421–443.
- Gallagher T (2005) Balancing difference and the common good: lessons from a post-conflict society. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative Education* 35: 429–442.

- Gettleman J (2010) Africa's forever wars. *Foreign Policy* March/April. Available at: <http://www.foreign-policy.com>.
- Glaser, BG and Strauss, AL (1967) *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company.
- Global Security (2005) Argentina's dirty war. Available at: <http://www.globalsecurity.org>.
- Global Security (2010) The world at war (past wars). Available at: <http://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/war/past.htm>.
- Gourevitch P (1998) *We Wish to Inform You That Tomorrow We Will be Killed With Our Families: Stories From Rwanda*. New York: Picador.
- Gumede W (2008) Mbeki's AIDS denial—grace or folly? *Pambazuka*, 369. Available at: <http://pambazuka.org/en/category/comment/47586>.
- Hahn C (1998) *Becoming Political: Comparative Perspectives on Citizenship Education*. Buffalo, NY: SUNY Press.
- Hahn C (2010) Comparative civic education research: what we know and what we need to know. *Citizenship Teaching and Learning* 6: 5–23.
- Harber C and Serf J (2006) Teacher education for a democratic society in England and South Africa. *Teaching and Teacher Education: An International Journal of Research and Studies* 22: 986–997.
- Harbom L, Strand H and Nygard H (2009) UCDP/PRIO armed conflict dataset codebook. Available at: http://www.prio.no/sptrans/-1423485763/Codebook_UCDP_PRIO%20Armed%20Conflict%20Dataset%20v4_2009.pdf.
- Hromadzic A (2008) Discourses of integration and practices of reunification at the Mostar Gymnasium, Bosnia and Herzegovina. *Comparative Education Review* 52: 541–563.
- Joseph G (1999) Civilizing the nation: Argentine narratives of education, race and democracy. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California at Santa Cruz, Santa Cruz, CA.
- Joseph S (2005) Teaching rights and responsibilities: paradoxes of globalization and children's citizenship in Lebanon. *Journal of Social History* 38: 1007–1026.
- King JT (2005) A difficult dialogue: educating citizens in a divided society. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Washington, Seattle, WA.
- Kirk J (2004) Promoting a gender-just peace: the roles of women teachers in peacebuilding and reconstruction. *Gender and Development* November: 50–59.
- Koutselini M (2008) Citizenship education in context: student teacher perceptions of citizenship in Cyprus. *Intercultural Education* 19: 163–175.
- Koutselini, M and Papanastasiou (1997) Civic Education in Cyprus - Issues in Focus - a curriculum research study. *Children's Social and Economics Education* 2(3): 113–129.
- Kubow, PK (2007) Teachers' constructions of democracy: intersections of Western and Indigenous knowledge in South Africa and Kenya *Comparative Education Review* 15(3): 307–328.
- Lacina B and Gleditsch PG (2004) *Monitoring Trends in Global Combat: A New Dataset of Battle Deaths*. Oslo: Centre for the Study of Civil War.
- Lomas BP (1999) Education for citizenship: comparative lessons for Northern Ireland. Doctoral dissertation, Queen's University of Belfast, Belfast, UK.
- Machel G (1996) Impact of armed conflict on children. New York,: United Nations. Available at: <http://daccessdds.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N96/219/55/PDF/N9621955.pdf?>
- Machel G (2007) Report of the special representative of the secretary-general for children and armed conflict. New York: United Nations. Available at: http://www.un.org/children/conflict/_documents/machel/MachelReviewReport.pdf.
- Mapiasse S (2007) Influence of the democratic climate of classrooms on student civic learning in North Sulawesi, Indonesia. *International Education Journal* 8(2): 393–407.
- Mason T (2005) From the Balkans to the Baltics: challenges for civic education in two eastern European countries. *International Journal of Social Education* 20: 115–131.
- Maxwell JA (2005) *Qualitative Research Design: An Interactive Approach*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Mirel J (2002) The decline of civic education. *Daedalus* 131: 49–55.

- Ndura E (2006) Transcending the majority rights and minority protection dichotomy through multicultural reflective citizenship in the African Great Lakes region. *Intercultural Education* 17: 195–205.
- Niens U and McIlrath L (2010) Understandings of citizenship education in Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland: public discourses among stakeholders in the public and private sectors. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice* 5: 73–87.
- Olsen M, Codd J and O'Neill A (2004) *Education Policy: Globalization, Citizenship, and Democracy*. London: Sage.
- Oraison M and Perez A (2009) The school in non-inclusive contexts: moral education, building citizenship and community development, an Argentinian example. *Journal of Moral Education* 38: 513–532.
- Papanastasiou C and Koutselini M (2003) Developmental model of democratic values and attitudes toward social actions. *International Journal of Educational Research* 39: 539–549.
- Plut D, Pesikan-Avramovic A, Pesic J, et al. (2002) What is democracy in textbooks? In: Daun H, Enslin P, Kolouh-Westin L, et al. (eds) *Democracy in Textbooks and Students Minds: Educational Transitions in Bosnia-Herzegovina, Yugoslavia, Mozambique and South Africa*. Hauppauge, NY: Nova Science Publishers, 108–143.
- Popadic D, Carrim T, N, et al. (2002) Teachers, students, and democracy. In Daun H, Enslin P, Kolouh-Westin L, et al. (eds) *Democracy in Textbooks and Students Minds: Educational Transitions in Bosnia-Herzegovina, Yugoslavia, Mozambique and South Africa*. Hauppauge, NY: Nova Science Publishers, 145–171.
- Porteus K, Motala S, Ruth T, et al. (2002) *Values, Education and Democracy. School-based Research Report: Opening Pathways for Dialogue*. Pretoria: Wits Education Policy Unit Consortium.
- Sambanis N (2003) Civil war list: 1946–1999. Available at: <http://pantheon.yale.edu/~ns237/index/research.html#Civil>.
- Sambanis N (2004) *Poverty and the Organization of Political Violence: A Review and Some Conjectures*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Schoeman S (2005) Educating democratic minds in South African public schools: African teachers' perceptions of good citizenship. *The Journal of Negro Education* 74: 275–286.
- Schulz W, Ainley J, Fraillon J, et al. (2010) *Initial Findings From the IEA International Civic and Citizenship Education Study*. Amsterdam: IEA.
- Schulz W and E Gonzalez (2011) Latin American perspectives on civic and citizenship education. Available at: http://iccs.acer.edu.au/uploads/File/AERA2011/AERA_ICCS_LA_perspectives%28NewOrleans2011%29.pdf.
- Schulz W, Ainley J, Friedman T, et al. (2011) *ICCS 2009 Latin American Report: Civic Knowledge and Attitudes Among Lower-Secondary Students in Six Latin American Countries*. Amsterdam: IEA.
- Soule S (2000) *Beyond Communism and War: The Effect of Civic Education on the Democratic Attitudes and Behavior of Bosnian and Herzegovinian Youth*. Calabasas, CA: Center for Civic Education.
- Spajic-Vrkas V (2003) Visions, provisions, and reality: political changes and education for democratic citizenship in Croatia. *Cambridge Journal of Education* 33: 33–51.
- Steiner-Kramsi, G, Turney-Purta, J and Schwille, J (Eds) (2002) *New Paradigms and Recurring Paradoxes in Education for Citizenship: an International Comparison*, Oxford: Elsevier Science.
- Suarez D (2008) Rewriting citizenship? civic education in Costa Rica and Argentina. *Comparative Education* 44: 485–503.
- Thornton, SJ (1991) Teacher as curricular-instructional gatekeeper in social studies, in JB Shaver (Ed) *Handbook of Research in Social Studies Teaching and Learning*, New York: Macmillan and Co., Chapter 19: 237–248.
- Tlhapi TJ (2007) Secondary school learners' experience of citizenship in a democratic South Africa. Unpublished master's thesis, University of South Africa.
- Torney-Purta J, Lehmann R, Oswald H, et al. (2001) *Citizenship and Education in Twenty-Eight Countries: Civic Knowledge and Engagement at Age Fourteen*. Delft: IEA
- UCDP (Uppsala Conflict Data Project). (2008) UCDP database. Available at: <http://www.pcr.uu.se/gpdata-base/search.php>.
- UNDP (2008) *Post Conflict Economic Recovery: Enabling Local Ingenuity*, New York: UNDP.

- UNESCO (2008a) The six EFA goals. Available at: http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=53844andURL_DO=DO_TOPICandURL_SECTION=201.html.
- UNESCO (2008b) Literacy portal. Available at: http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=54369andURL_DO=DO_TOPICandURL_SECTION=201.html.
- USAID (2011) *USAID marks 50 years of promoting peace and prosperity*. Available at: www.usaid.gov/rdma
- US Department of State (2010a) Background note: Colombia. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- US Department of State (2010b) Background note: Cyprus. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- US Department of State (2010c) Background note: Guatemala. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- US Department of State (2010d) Background note: Indonesia. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- US Department of State (2010e) Background note: Ireland. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- US Department of State (2010f) Background note: Laos. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- US Department of State (2010g) Background note: Lebanon. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- US Department of State (2010h) Background note: Mozambique. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- US Department of State (2010i) Background note: South Africa. Available at: <http://www.state.gov>.
- Waghid Y (2009) Education and madrassahs in South Africa: on preventing the possibility of extremism. *British Journal of Religious Education* 31: 117–128.
- Watling R and Arlow M (2002). Wishful thinking: lessons from the internal and external evaluations of an innovative education project in Northern Ireland. *Evaluation and Research in Education* 16: 166–181.
- Weinstein HM, Freedman SW and Hughson H (2007) School voices: challenges facing education systems after identity-based conflicts. *Education, Citizenship, and Social Justice* 2: 41–71.

Appendix A. Summaries of all referenced studies

Author (year)	Country	Setting	Data Source / Method	Participants	Findings
Middle East and Asia					
Akar (2007)	Lebanon	Private schools in urban area	Qualitative and quantitative survey	Grade 11 students (N = 31)	Students placed a high value on democratic principles and national identity. However, a classroom climate based on memorization and distrust of politicians discouraged active participation.
Akar (2006)	Lebanon	Private secondary schools near an urban area	Semi-structured interviews	Secondary civics education teachers (N = 4)	Teachers stated beliefs in rights, responsibilities and dialogue as central components of citizenship education. However, they also pointed to the difficulties of promoting democratic citizenship in a society that exhibited substantial corruption and authoritarian tendencies.
Joseph (2005)	Lebanon	One rural village, after the civil war	Ethnographic study; semi-structured interviews and family observations	Inhabitants of the village (children ages 5–13; N = 100)	In opposition to the liberal global discourse about citizenship and human rights as individual and universal, children were socialized to access rights through relationships with other.
Fox (2003)	Laos	-----	Curriculum analysis: Laotian Basic Education	-----	Textbooks omitted discussions of minority rights and issues specific to minority study. They also omitted mention of gender discrimination.
Mapiasse (2007)	Indonesia	North Sulawesi	Quantitative survey based on IEA Civic Education Study	Students in ninth-grade civic education classrooms (N = 930)	Democratic climate of the classroom was the most powerful predictor of student engagement and civic knowledge. Student engagement was a powerful predictor of student conceptions of democracy; Student conceptions of democracy were useful in predicting students' conceptions of citizenship. The discussion of controversial issues in the classroom had a negative relationship to democratic climate.

Appendix A. (Continued)

Author (year)	Country	Setting	Data Source / Method	Participants	Findings
Latin America (Central and South America)					
Joseph (1999)	Argentina	Buenos Aires	Ethnographic study	Members of the middle class who had attended an elite school	Individuals identified 'being civilized' as an important aspect of their national identity promoted by this school.
Astiz and Mendez (2006)	Argentina		Curriculum analysis: core content standards (CBC)		Although the federal education law emphasized citizenship education, the common curriculum mentioned citizenship as a topic only once in its table of contents. The majority of the textbooks concentrated on teaching national history and only discussed discrimination and cultural difference in a superficial way. Between the periods of 1983–1994 and 1994–2008, textbooks mentioned more global aspects of citizenship and fewer national or 'traditional' aspects of citizenship. Teachers both expected parents to help students academically but believed parents to be illiterate and uneducated. A community initiative to provide breakfast for students dwindled because teachers identified the project as both extra unpaid work and as not a proper use of their time, as it was not focused on academic work.
Suarez (2008)	Argentina		Textbook analysis (of 9 textbooks)		
Oraison and Perez (2009)	Argentina	Poor urban high school	Participatory action research	Students (N = 20), teachers (N = 12) and parents (N = 40)	
Frisancho and Reategui (2009)	Peru		Large-scale survey	6th grade (N = 13,708) and 11th grade (N = 14,305) students	Over half of students were not able to distinguish between a democracy and a dictatorship, identify their own rights and responsibilities, identify corrupt behavior or explain the connections between the role of media and democracy
Schultz and Gonzalez (2011)	Colombia, Guatemala	Random sample	Large-scale survey	8th grade Colombia (N = 6204) Guatemala (N = 4002)	More than half of students in both Colombia and Guatemala had low civic knowledge achievement scores. Students who demonstrated higher civic knowledge expressed less acceptance of authoritarianism and corruption.

(continued)

Appendix A. (Continued)

Author (year)	Country	Setting	Data Source / Method	Participants	Findings
Europe Koutselini (2008)	Cyprus	University of Cyprus	Interviews	Greek Cypriot Pre-service teachers (N = 50)	Pre-service teachers identified citizenship as an active concept, linked with community service and civic action. They did not trust political parties as a valid avenue for civic participation. Mixed feelings about belonging to a global community.
Papanastasiou and Koutselini (2003)	Cyprus	-----	Large-Scale Survey (IEA Civic Education Study)	9th grade students representing all secondary schools (N = 1788)	Students' democratic values influenced their participation in social actions. In addition, both the school climate and students' political interests influenced students' political environment and democratic values.
Koutselini and Papanastasiou (1997)	Cyprus	-----	Curriculum and textbook analysis (primary school textbooks)	-----	Although the national goals for civic education included the need for students to learn how to discuss controversial issues, the textbooks concentrated on the idea of cooperation rather than the ways in which difficult decisions must be made by a society.
Mason (2005)	Macedonia	South eastern European University	Interviews	Teacher education students (N = 31)	Teacher education students expressed that teachers should encourage intercultural understanding by giving students' exposure to people from different linguistic and cultural backgrounds, and focusing on common European citizenship.
Hromadzic (2008)	Bosnia-Herzegovina	Mostar Gymnasium	Ethnographic fieldwork (22 months)	School community	Struggles between the international community and the Croat political community resulted in a school with a unified administration but providing two separate curricula to students.
Soule (2000)	Bosnia-Herzegovina	Schools participating in Civitas program	Survey	Secondary students (N = 1991)	Participation in the Civitas program predicted increased measures of student political knowledge, participatory skills, attitudes and core values.

Appendix A. (Continued)

Author (year)	Country	Setting	Data Source / Method	Participants	Findings
Watling and Arlow (2002)	Northern Ireland	Schools participating in pilot program	Semi-structured interviews, fieldwork, surveys	25 representative schools	Teachers felt the citizenship education curriculum was effective but difficult to assess. Students reported enjoying SCaPE, citing both the open atmospheres in the classroom and their acquisition of skills including the ability to think before speaking.
Niens and McIlrath (2010)	Northern Ireland		Semi-structured interviews	Community leaders	Citizenship education should be based upon human rights, in order to avoid instilling nationalism into students living in a divided society. In order to avoid indoctrination of students, participants said teachers needed to help students think critically about controversial issues.
Lomas (1999)	Northern Ireland		Surveys, focus groups	14–24 year olds (N = 1300)	Students showed overall interest in political issues and a desire to deal with controversial issues. They also identified a need to acquire political literacy in schools in order to be able to engage politically.
King (2005)	Northern Ireland	Belfast	Qualitative case study	Catholic and Protestant students (N = 22)	Students only seriously considered differing perspectives with significant teacher or staff prompting.
Donnelly, (2004)	Northern Ireland	Integrated schools	Interviews	Teachers (N = 18)	Teachers chose to avoid controversial topics, reinforcing a culture of avoidance. This culture compromised the purpose of an integrated school.
Africa Freedman et al. (2008)	Rwanda		Interviews, focus groups	Teachers, members of ministry of education	Curriculum and teacher training developed to encourage democratic inquiry was ultimately abandoned when a new government came to power. Teachers expressed a need for a singular historical narrative to give to students.

(continued)

Appendix A. (Continued)

Author (year)	Country	Setting	Data Source / Method	Participants	Findings
Porteus et al. (2002)	South Africa	Five provinces	Surveys and participatory workshops	Teachers, parents, students at 97 schools	Educators reported holding negative beliefs about parents and students and valued obedience and discipline. Most students asserted that they felt disrespected by educators' language, use of corporal punishment and sexual abuse towards girls. Parents expressed feeling disrespected by teachers and frustrated by the unequal resources available to different schools.
Waghid (2009)	South Africa	Madrasahs in Western Cape	Interviews	Teachers (N = 20)	Educators promoted respect for life but did not emphasize critical thinking or active participation 'due to time constraints and large classes' (p. 119).
Kubow (2007)	South Africa		Focus group interviews	Teachers (N = 27)	Teachers discussed democracy as involving values, equality, and freedom; specifically, values included tolerance, hard work, <i>ubuntu</i> , equality focused on gender equality, and freedom involved both freedom of speech and of participation.
Shoeman (2005)	South Africa	East Rand in the province of Gauteng	Interviews	Primary and secondary teachers (N = 30)	Teachers found communitarian characteristics, including responsibility, morality, tolerance and participation, to be the most important aspects of citizenship for students to acquire.
Harber and Serf (2006)	South Africa		Open-ended interviews	Teacher education students (N = 18)	Teachers also emphasized the need for students to develop critical thinking skills.
Tlhapi (2007)	South Africa	Secondary schools in the North West province	Focus group interviews conducted in single-sex groups	Secondary students in grade 12 (ages 17–19; N = 13: 6 female, 7 male)	Students recounted learning how to hold classroom discussions, but not learning how to deal with controversial issues. Most teacher education courses conducted through lecture.
					Students reported democratic participation in their families, with their peers and on a national level. However, within their schools and communities, students stated that they did not participate in a democratic fashion, and that these spaces seemed more autocratic.

Appendix A. (Continued)

Author (year)	Country	Setting	Data Source / Method	Participants	Findings
Finkel and Ernst, (2005)	South Africa		Quantitative survey	Secondary students (N = 600)	Students exposed to participatory methods developed higher levels of democratic values and skills.
Multi-country studies					
Weinstein et al. (2007)	Croatia, Kosovo, Bosnia and Herzegovina and Rwanda	Representative sites (both urban and rural)	Interviews and focus groups	Students, parents, teachers, and other educators (N = 545)	Participants' attitudes towards teaching and schools were steeped in a fear of violence reappearing. Participants voiced differing opinions about the distribution of power among different ethnic groups. Tensions over power and fear of violence affected the participants' views of the curriculum.
Plut et al. (2002)	South Africa, Mozambique, Bosnia-Herzegovina and 'Yugoslavia' (Serbia)	-----	Textbook analysis	History and mother tongue language books for the last year of compulsory education	Textbooks in Bosnia-Herzegovina and Serbia stressed loyalty to one's own ethnic group over peace education. Textbooks in South Africa and Mozambique emphasized national independence, though textbooks from South Africa were the only ones to emphasize critical thinking skills.
Popadic et al. (2002)	South Africa, Mozambique, Bosnia-Herzegovina and 'Yugoslavia' (Serbia)	Representative areas of countries	Large-scale survey	Teachers (N = 318) and students (N = 3851)	In Bosnia and Herzegovina, teachers (N = 155) expressed distrust in their present political system and low awareness of techniques for conflict resolution. In South Africa, teachers expressed views that democracy was a political concept which existed in the political realm but did not extend to the composition of the school. Students in Serbia, Bosnia-Herzegovina and Mozambique reported distrust in politicians and a belief in authoritarianism. Information they received about democracy came from television. South African students showed a high level of civic knowledge and positive attitude towards democratic participation.